WP1
Understanding Arts as a channel for school equity

Deliverable 1.3.
Final Analysis Case Studies (Case-Study-Report)

Pfefferwerk Foundation
Minorities groups Education Through Art
Erasmus + Forward looking cooperation project:
Project number 54564662

Deliverable nr. 1.3.
Deliverable Title Final Analysis Case Studies

Document ID META DLV-1.3. Final
Dissemination level PU
Main Author Margitta Haertel, Anja Müller, Andrea Lang
Pfefferwerk Foundation
Issue Date December 2016

DOCUMENT INFORMATION

Document Change log

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Version</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>v0.1</td>
<td>July 2016</td>
<td>First draft of document</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>v0.2</td>
<td>October-December 2016</td>
<td>Final draft of the document:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Long version in October 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Short (final) version in December 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>v0.3</td>
<td>November-December 2016</td>
<td>Proof reading the final draft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>v0.4</td>
<td>December 2016</td>
<td>First final version, approved by Executive Board, (will be) submitted to EACEA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Verification and Approval

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Verification Final draft by the WP leader</td>
<td>STPW December 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verification Final Draft by Peer Reviewer</td>
<td>UNIFI December 2016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This publication reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.
**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION – THE CASE STUDY REPORT IN THE CONTEXT OF THE META PROJECT</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE TARGET OF THE FINAL CASE STUDY REPORT AT THE END AND AS RESULT OF</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WP1 IN THE FRAMEWORK OF THE META-PROJECT “MINORITY EDUCATION THROUGH ART”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. THE ANALYSIS OF THE CASE STUDIES</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE APPROACH AND THE PROCEDURE IN THE COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS OF THE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CASE STUDIES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. THE 40 SELECTED AND ANALYSED CASE STUDIES</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. THE TYPOLOGY OF THE SELECTED CASE STUDIES</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QUANTITATIVE EVALUATION AND RESULTS – PROJECT DATA AND HARD FACTS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. THE MAIN TOPICS OF THE CASE STUDIES</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. CONCLUSIONS</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. RECOMMENDATIONS</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFERENCES / BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION – THE CASE STUDY REPORT IN THE CONTEXT OF THE META PROJECT
THE TARGET OF THE FINAL CASE STUDY REPORT AT THE END AND AS RESULT OF WP1 IN THE FRAMEWORK OF THE META-PROJECT “MINORITY EDUCATION THROUGH ARTS”

The main objective of META (Minority Education Through Art) is to find ways to minimize and to eliminate the barriers that cause inequity in education systems and to reduce disparities in learning outcomes affecting learners from disadvantaged backgrounds by art-integrated learning.

The META project aims to provide an in-depth knowledge of effective methodologies and tools that use different art forms to reduce disparities in learning affecting (pre-primary and primary) students from minority groups and to develop an innovative and collaborative teaching and learning methodology for European teachers that will contribute to social cohesion, European citizenship and social economic inclusion. Through an art-learning approach the young learners will gain essential skills such as motivation, concentration, confidence, teamwork, cognitive ability, critical thinking, verbal skills, etc. We assume that the use of art in the class is closely related to students’ academic achievement, social and emotional development, civic engagement and equitable opportunity.

According to the Institute of Policy Studies in Education (London Metropolitan University), “migrant education is the most important issue facing European education over the next decade”. Migrant children form a large percentage of the EU population and are (as children belonging to minority groups) disproportionally overrepresented among early school leavers (ESL). They have a number of specific education needs that are not currently met through our mainstream education policy.

The overall objective of this Case Study Report is to provide a summary of 40 approaches, methods, practices and art activities that have been extensively researched by five European partners within META.

The further aim of the Case Study report is, after thorough analysis, to lead to deeper insight into different art educational processes. This portfolio provides an insight into some best practice cases studies.

BASIC POINTS REGARDING ART EDUCATION

The following statements are pertinent to Art Education issues:

- The Universal Declaration of Human Rights:
  - Article 26: Education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality and to the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms. It shall promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations, racial or religious groups, and shall further the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace.
  - Article 27: Everyone has the right freely to participate in the cultural life of the community, to enjoy the art and to share in scientific advancement and its benefits.

- The Convention on the Rights of the Child:
  - Article 29: The education of the child shall be directed to ...(a) The development of the child's personality, talents and mental and physical abilities to their fullest potential...
  - Article 31: State parties shall respect and promote the right of the child to participate fully in cultural and artistic life and shall encourage the provision of appropriate and equal opportunities for cultural, artistic, recreational and leisure activity.’

In the context of this report, we can refer to a range of available guidelines, discussion papers, white papers and reports that have been taken into account during the process of finding and analyzing best practice projects within the main topic of Minority Education Through Art.

THE MOST IMPORTANT DOCUMENTS

- Road Map for Art Education – results of the first UNESCO World Conference on Art Education in Lisbon (2006)
• The European Agenda on Migration (2016)
• Education at a Glance 2015 OECD INDICATORS
• Education for All (EFA) Global Monitoring Report of 2006
• Fundamental Rights Report 2016, OSCE
• Sustainable Development Goals 2015 (Goal 4: Ensure inclusive an equitable quality education an promotion lifelong learning opportunities for all)

DEFINITION ART EDUCATION

UNESCO promotes two main approaches to Art Education, which can be implemented at the same time and need not be distinct. The “learning through art/culture” approach demonstrates how we can utilize artistic expressions and cultural resources and practices, contemporary and traditional, as a learning tool. It aims to draw on the rich wealth of culture, knowledge and skills of societies to enhance an inter-disciplinary approach to learning in a range of subject areas.

The “learning in art/culture” approach stresses the value of cultural perspectives, multi and inter-cultural and culturally-sensitive languages through learning processes. This kind of approach contributes to engender understanding of the importance of cultural diversity and reinforce behavior patterns underlying social cohesion. With META we are acting within the framework of „learning through art”.

THE LEADING GUIDELINES FOR OUR RESEARCH ARE THE KEY COMPETENCES FOR LIFELONG LEARNING

Competences are defined here as a combination of knowledge, skills and attitudes appropriate to the context. Key competences are those which all individuals need for personal fulfilment and development, active citizenship, social inclusion and employment.

The Reference Framework sets out eight key competences:

1) Communication in the mother tongue
2) Communication in foreign languages
3) Mathematical competence and basic competences in science and technology
4) Digital competence
5) Learning to learn
6) Social and civic competences
7) Sense of initiative and entrepreneurship
8) Cultural awareness and expression

The key competences are all considered equally important, because each of them can contribute to a successful life in a knowledge society. Many of the competences overlap and interlock: aspects essential to one domain will support competence in another. Competence in the fundamental basic skills of language, literacy, numeracy and in information and communication technologies (ICT) is an essential foundation for learning, and learning to learn supports all learning activities.

In the analysis of the case studies, the focus is on the following three competences: Social and civic competences (6), cultural awareness and expression (8) and learning to learn (5).

KEY INDICATORS FOR SOCIAL INCLUSION

In many OECD countries, immigrant students have more restricted access to quality education, leave school earlier and have lower academic achievement than their native peers. That makes improving the education of immigrant students a policy priority. (Education at a Glance 2015)

While there has been extensive research on the integration of migrants into labor markets, little work has been done internationally to examine the education outcomes of their children and explore education policy interventions to improve their performance.

The OECD conducted policy reviews of migrant education in Austria, Denmark, Ireland, the Netherlands, Norway and Sweden and examined the migrant education experience in many countries. Even though the reports on the piloting countries are not available yet, we could refer to some existing criteria within the OECD reports that have already been published.
SOME KEY QUESTIONS ARE:

**Access to education:**
- Do immigrant pupils have the same opportunities to access quality education as their native peers?
- What policies can ensure access to quality education for immigrant pupils, especially those from low socio-economic backgrounds?

**Participation:**
- Do immigrant pupils participate (enroll and complete) as much as their native peers?
- What are the effective re-integration programs for early school leavers, preventive interventions for potential early school leavers, and introductory programs for newly arrived immigrant pupils to encourage better integration into school?

**Learning outcomes:**
- Do immigrant pupils perform as well as their native peers?


**SOCIAL INCLUSION**

The long-term development of societies, politically and economically, depends to a great extent on the knowledge, skills, values and competences acquired by people at an early age. Educational and working opportunities for young people are also fundamental to enhance social cohesion, by discouraging people from engaging in illegal activities, reducing political and social conflict, and increasing trust in others and in institutions.

Social inclusion, demography and migration is one of the seven key challenges of the EU Sustainable Development Strategy (EU SDS). The set of indicators which was agreed to measure progress in the social inclusion theme in the area of education are, for example: Early leavers from education and training (operational indicators) and Low reading literacy performance of pupils (Explanatory indicators); Individuals' level of computer skills; Individuals' level of internet skills.

**KEY INDICATORS FOR A SUSTAINABLE ART EDUCATION**

Last but not least we also would like to refer to the 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDG’s), especially the Goal No 4: « Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all". These should be the overall guiding goals for educational strategies on the local/national and EU level as well.

Source: [https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/topics/sustainabledevelopmentgoals](https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/topics/sustainabledevelopmentgoals)

1. **THE ANALYSIS OF THE CASE STUDIES**

**THE APPROACH AND THE PROCEDURE IN THE COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS OF THE CASE STUDIES**

In this Work-Package One 40 case studies have been selected, which show the variety of effective art-learning approaches to combat inequity in school education in the different EU contexts by taking care of the cultural and social integration of marginalised groups.

The collected case studies across Europe represent a picture of art-integrated learning. The key features taken into consideration are: type of intervention and its organisation, how the service was implemented, the network-action and the training needs.

We formulate the factors which enable equality to create a common understanding of art as a channel for cultural and social integration. And we determine the links between specific interventions and their results, the efficiency of interventions in terms of effect versus resources (monetary and human).

---

1 referral link: [http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/web/sdi/indicators/social-inclusion](http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/web/sdi/indicators/social-inclusion)
We present the level of implementation in various countries of those methodologies based on art and aiming at facilitating the social and cultural integration of marginalised kids. The results will be integrated in a following META-methodology.

The objective of the research was primarily to provide a collection of best-practice examples which improve equity in school education in Europe and use different methodologies, with a main focus on art integration.

The aim was to identify 40 cases of initiatives, which improve access, participation and integration to formal education for marginalized groups across Europe.

Within the partnership a grid with quantitative and qualitative indicators has been developed and discussed. Out of the grid a questionnaire was constructed, to collect the information according to the agreed indicators. In a pre-survey the central information has been collected to derive the final cases for the finalized survey questionnaire that depicts all agreed indicators.

Researchers from the consortium have been tasked in collecting case studies on equity in education and different art-based methodologies - from ARTinED and ART4ROM repositories, academic papers, conference publications, EU projects, country legislation and policy promotion or projects promoted through the partners’ contacts amongst Education Networks, in terms of art integration for multiculturalism and deliverables/results of EU projects.

The predetermined period was completed projects from the last 3-5 years as well as ongoing (even on a voluntary level) and repeated projects.

Altogether, 40 case studies have been selected by the consortium of five partners in three European countries. The final report provides a summary of approaches, methods, practices and activities which have been analysed to develop a META methodology.

There are different types of case studies that have been collected:

- **individual projects**, which are located in one place
- **or bigger projects/programs** which are located in different places in one or more countries (up to a global scale).

All the cases have been collected through the above-described, custom-built questionnaire-tool, which allows submission of cases by partners, verification of those cases and classification/categorisation.

The guiding question in analyzing the 40 case studies has been: «How to use art for improving equity in and accessibility to education?»

### 2. THE 40 SELECTED AND ANALYSED CASE STUDIES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>ORGANIZATION AND PLACE</th>
<th>SHORT DESCRIPTION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Menschen im Aufwind / Human Beeings gain height</td>
<td>Drama School mobile, Marktoberdorf Germany</td>
<td>The project offers a summer camp with a structured framework including creative workshops (different art forms). All teachers are professional artists. Experienced and qualified instructors/ professional artists lead the workshops. Link: <a href="http://www.menschen-im-aufwind.de">www.menschen-im-aufwind.de</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Voices of diversity – Street Art Langwasser</td>
<td>City of Nuernberg, Office for Culture Recreation. Germany</td>
<td>Children with or without a migrant background created a concept of a Graffito and young people and adults were responsible for the creative implementation of the Graffito. Link: <a href="http://www.kuf-kultur.de">www.kuf-kultur.de</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Workshops for young</td>
<td>City of Helsinki, Education dept, Youth and Adult</td>
<td>Main aim is to minimize barriers and maximize resources of young people to enter vocational education. For some youngsters (average 350/year) main target is to finish such 5...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number</td>
<td>Project Name</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td><strong>ArctiChildren II</strong></td>
<td>University of Lapland, Rovaniemi Finland, Norway, Russia, Sweden Cross-border training programme supporting school education – focus on environmental and community art activities that support Sámi cultural identity and well-being in schools using art-based action research as a method (relationship between contemporary art, cultural identity and wellbeing).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td><strong>UNITY</strong></td>
<td>Studieförbundet Vuxenskolan, SV Gävleborg, Gävle Sweden Project contents include dancing with children in school, graffiti-, dance- and rap-workshops for youngsters, after-school-programs (workshops); in 3 years around 5000 participants, most of them feeling excluded from the society, school, work, organisations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td><strong>Playground for Theatre</strong></td>
<td>Bunker, Ljubljana Slovenia The aim is to offer employment to young artists, teaching contemporary cultural and artistic contents (primary and secondary schools). Its contents are: education program for the young artists and the participating teachers; cultural days for the schools; tandem hours in regularly classes (art as a pedagogical tool) – cooperation of artists and teachers in teaching mandatory themes but through art.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td><strong>Baraka – Art therapy with unaccompanied minors</strong></td>
<td>Amarant Association Hungary In an Unaccompanied Minors’ home, Amarant organizes art therapy and communal activities weekly and daily during the summer using methods of experiential education. Special programs provide them a possibility to ‘play the trauma out’ of themselves. During 1 year: 500 unaccompanied minors and 75 Hungarian teenagers involved in more than 100 workshops (5 different art methods); 4 exhibitions of the art work of all involved children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td><strong>Integration – Inclusion</strong></td>
<td>Round Table Theatre in Education Company, Szada Hungary Aim: give the experience of the theatre for those who do not have the chance to attend it, increase social responsibility and active democracy in Hungarian regions where there is a great lack of it; providing the method theatre in education (TIE) – ongoing for years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td><strong>PLANTERS</strong></td>
<td>Associación ConArte Internacional, Masos de Pais Spain The project is focused on Art Education in public primary and secondary schools. It currently operates at 5 primary and 3 secondary schools (music, dance, theatre). Artists and art teachers work with the school’s teachers in designing and implementing the art educational programs in the specific disciplines and schools – starting with training programs on art pedagogy, emotional education and expressive languages and culture, monthly training sessions on specific topics.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Case Study Report</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Anasa Multicultural Troupe – A Caravan without Boarders</td>
<td>The Cultural centre of African Art and Cultures ANASA, Athens Greece The project aimed at raising awareness about human rights and rights of children refugees and unaccompanied minors through performing art. The multicultural troupe consisted of 7 participants of Greek and migrant descent. The program lasted 8 months and covered 8 different geographical areas. Each school the troupe visited was offered a 3-day workshop which ended with a performance of the participants open to the public. During the travels, the troupe offered educational seminars for primary school teachers on how to approach humanitarian issues with a multidisciplinary, interactive, artistic method. Link: <a href="http://www.anasa.org.gr">www.anasa.org.gr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>P.I.N.O.K.I.O. – Pupils for Innovation as a key to intercultural and social inclusion</td>
<td>FNCC, Pescia Italy The project aims to promote intercultural dialogue, using fairy tale characters to develop key competences through innovative approaches; based on the idea of INTEGRATION of activities for and with children. The project has introduced children's stories characters from local cultures and countries of origin of migrant children. The classroom activities (children from 3 to 11 years): choice of a tale or a text coming from children’s stories/literature, storytelling, work on characters and produce e-tools, creativity labs, workshops with parents in relation with tales, blog. A training of trainers and a teacher’s training were developed to pilot the model in the school settings. Link: <a href="http://www.pinocchio.it/">http://www.pinocchio.it/</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>ARTinED – A new approach to education using art</td>
<td>FNCC, Pescia Italy, Romania, Spain, Sweden, Turkey e, United Kingdom During two years of project implementation the partnership developed a methodology that intends to activate and develop a mechanism for learners to retain the contents of any school subjects through a holistic approach and using art to teach all school subjects; tested in 8 schools in 6 countries and in two In-Service Training Courses. Outcomes: ARTinED Repository of academic studies, Background Report -use of individual art forms in education-, Environmental Education Teaching Report, Teacher/Student Piloting Materials, Best Practice Case Studies, Use Case Scenarios, Guide for ARTinED Teachers and Curriculum Experts. Link: <a href="http://www.artined.eu/home.html">http://www.artined.eu/home.html</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Do.re.mat. – Decreasing Obstacles Related to Mathematics Teaching</td>
<td>ENFAP Emilia Romagna, Bologna Italy Do.re.mat correlates all the math skills of the curriculum from secondary school to the third grade of secondary school. The methodological approach foresees the cooperation of maths and music teachers in realising lessons structured as maths-music labs where theory, listening and exercises alternate. The methodological manual (published by Digital Docet, Modena) is designed as a step by step process that enables the transfer of the Do.re.mat method in different educational contexts. Link: <a href="http://www.enfap.emr.it/wp/">http://www.enfap.emr.it/wp/</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>ARTES – ART as a vehicle for education and social inclusion</td>
<td>Grotsky Theatre, Bielsko-Biała Poland The ARTES project answers the need to create a trans-sectorial platform for the exchange of training methodologies and approaches developed by the previous LLP projects in the field of inclusive art as well as effective multiplication and mainstreaming of their validated results. The project has created an online community of practices open to European educators, artists and scholars engaged in social inclusion. It collected a selection of 80 projects and 22 learning paths. Link: <a href="http://artescommunity.eu/">http://artescommunity.eu/</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td><strong>Minority Inclusion shouldn’t be illusion</strong></td>
<td>Central European Initiative - CEI, Triest and Ministry of Culture and Information of Serbia, Hungary, Romania, Bulgaria, Albania, Croatia, FYR Macedonia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Greece, and Serbia.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td><strong>The Learning and Performance Network</strong></td>
<td>Royal Shakespeare Company, Stratford-upon-Avon, United Kingdom and Internationally</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td><strong>Miracles – Migrants and Refugees - A Challenge for Learning in European Schools</strong></td>
<td>CESIE partner of the project; Coordinator Germany, Palermo, Germany, Italy, Malta, Slovenia, Hungary, Switzerland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td><strong>Insart</strong></td>
<td>CESIE, Palermo, France, Belgium, UK, Germany and Italy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td><strong>BODI</strong></td>
<td>Elan Intercultures, Paris, Cyprus, Austria, Spain, Italy, France</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. <strong>Diversity Tales</strong></td>
<td>Cardet (Zypern) Diversity Development Group’ (DDG), Nikosia Portugal, Romania, Lithuanian Cyprus</td>
<td>The project is equipping practitioners with tools, attitudes and competences to manage and to work with diversity through interactions between learners from diverse backgrounds; main tool: picture books for specific educational purposes (incl. tests, training, guide and platform). Link: <a href="http://diversitytales.com/index.php/en/">http://diversitytales.com/index.php/en/</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. <strong>Artful Thinking Project – Stronger thinking and learning through the power of art</strong></td>
<td>Harvard University USA</td>
<td>Artful Thinking is part of the Visible Thinking initiative at Harvard Project Zero – a research-based approach to teaching. Goals: to help teachers create connections between works of art and the curriculum, and to help teachers use art as a force for developing students’ thinking dispositions. It is designed to be used by the regular classroom teacher, not necessarily art specialists. Link: <a href="http://pzartfullthinking.org/">http://pzartfullthinking.org/</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. <strong>Enhancing Children’s Visual and Verbal Language skills through Wayang in Indonesia</strong></td>
<td>INSEA Portugal, Viseu Indonesia</td>
<td>The project focuses on enhancing children’s visual and verbal language using traditional Wayang (shadow theatre). Playing with Wayang helps in enhancing children’s kinaesthetic, audio, and visual abilities along with art making and learning about Indonesia’s cultural tradition. Link: <a href="http://insea.org/publications/volume-3-number-3-article">http://insea.org/publications/volume-3-number-3-article</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. <strong>INSETRom</strong></td>
<td>European University Cyprus, Egkomi Cyprus, Austria, Italy, Greece, Slovakia, Netherlands, Romania, United Kingdom</td>
<td>The project contributes to a better understanding and facilitates Roma inclusion and participation in the schooling system. Based on the teacher’s needs of appropriate training to improve their understanding of Roma history and culture, and enable them to respond to the challenge of teaching in classrooms with Roma children, the project develops and tests needs-based teacher training curricula, and action plans at class and/or school level. Additionally, it disseminates good practices of Roma inclusion in the partners’ educational systems and aims to foster a common European perspective about Roma and their education. Link: <a href="http://www.iaie.org/insetrom/1_about.html">http://www.iaie.org/insetrom/1_about.html</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. <strong>MUS-E</strong></td>
<td>IYMF, Brussels Austria, Belgium, Finland, France, Germany, Hungary, Italy, Kosovo, Lichtenstein, Portugal, Spain and Switzerland) plus Israel</td>
<td>The MUS-E programme is set within the teaching curriculum and educational project of the schools involved for a period of at least three years (12 countries). MUS-E activities take place within schools throughout the school year, in close collaboration between the artistic and the teaching staff and as a part of the school’s official curriculum. The nature of the program consists not in learning art but in learning through the art as a methodology, the aim is not to become an artist but to prepare future citizens and promote their participation in personal growth (music, songs, dance, the performing art and the plastic art). Link: <a href="http://www.menuhin-foundation.com/portfolio/mus-eartists/">http://www.menuhin-foundation.com/portfolio/mus-eartists/</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Project Name</td>
<td>Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.</td>
<td><strong>MUS-E connect</strong></td>
<td>IYMF, Brussels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.</td>
<td><strong>Art4Rom</strong></td>
<td>IYMF, Brussels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.</td>
<td><strong>Music4Rom</strong></td>
<td>IYMF, Brussels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28.</td>
<td><strong>No child left behind</strong></td>
<td>Law, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.</td>
<td><strong>Languages &amp; Integration through singing</strong></td>
<td>FENICE, Napoli</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30.</td>
<td><strong>European Music Portfolio</strong></td>
<td>Landesinstitut für Schulsport, Schulkunst und Schulmusik, Ludwigsburg England, UK, Finland, Scotland, Greece, Romania, Spain, France and Switzerland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31.</td>
<td><strong>YRAEF - Young Roma Artist Education Fund</strong></td>
<td>The Association for Culture, Education and Communication (ACEC), Bratislava Slovakia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32.</td>
<td><strong>You see me – I see you / Cultural diversity in the eyes of the Roma</strong></td>
<td>Faculty of Art, University of Ljubljana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33.</td>
<td><strong>Roma people invited to the library</strong></td>
<td>Metlika library Slovenia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34.</td>
<td><strong>Ordinary opportunities for unusual people</strong></td>
<td>Fundacja Edukacji Przedszkolnej, Wroclaw Poland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35.</td>
<td><strong>School for Tolerance</strong></td>
<td>Ministry of Education, Youth and Science, Sofia Bulgaria</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## 36. “CirSchool” plus similar project with other funding; specific area of intervention called “Circus in Education”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Project</strong></th>
<th><strong>Organization</strong></th>
<th><strong>Location</strong></th>
<th><strong>Description</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“CirSchool”</td>
<td>Albert &amp; Friends Instant Circus</td>
<td>London, Great Britain</td>
<td>Comprehensive educational programme based around a broad range of physical art activities for all (acrobatics, clowning, stilts walking, juggling, unicycling, ball walking, tightrope, dance and movement) - CirSchool promotes the idea that students can learn and consolidate their knowledge and competences – both in subjects and transversal – by engaging in physical activities, in an environment in which they can directly experiment with their training experiences. Link: <a href="http://www.albertandfriendsinstantcircus.co.uk/what-we-do/education-schools/">http://www.albertandfriendsinstantcircus.co.uk/what-we-do/education-schools/</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 37. REYN – Romani Early Years Network

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Network</strong></th>
<th><strong>Organizations</strong></th>
<th><strong>Countries</strong></th>
<th><strong>Description</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>REYN – Romani Early Years Network (hosted by the ISSA – International Step by Step Association), Leiden</td>
<td>Albania, Australia, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Belgium, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Croatia, Estonia, France, Hungary, Italy, Kazakhstan, Kosovo, Kyrgyzstan, Latvia, Lithuania, Luxembourg, Macedonia, Moldova, Mongolia, Montenegro, Romania, Poland, Russia, Republic of Serbia, Slovakia, Slovenia, Tajikistan, Netherlands, Turkey, Ukraine, United Kingdom</td>
<td>REYN Italy: two-year project using art education at school. The project involved 63 pupils (18 Roma, 45 non-Roma) in dancing and theatre workshops held in two primary schools in Rome. Link: <a href="https://www.facebook.com/ReynNetwork">https://www.facebook.com/ReynNetwork</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 38. MUS-E

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Organizations</strong></th>
<th><strong>Location</strong></th>
<th><strong>Description</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MUS-E Italia Onlus, Bologna agency and Istituto Comprensivo ICI 8, Bologna</td>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>In three months (January to April), for the period included between second and fourth year of primary school, MUS-E artists, always in pairs, enter in the classroom and collaborate with the teachers in order to activate children's creativity through different kinds of art. Children learn how to use their hands, body, and creativity in order to express themselves and communicate with each other. The program enables professional artists to share their passion and knowledge in primary schools collaborating with teachers to embed music, dance and visual art in the curriculum. Link: <a href="http://www.mus-e.it/index.php?idSede=4">http://www.mus-e.it/index.php?idSede=4</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In the first stage, a general level of analysis has been applied to the case studies, to sort them by target-groups, type and scale of intervention and other RELEVANT GROUPINGS, determined by the nature of the cases submitted. This enables the creation of the following typology of studies, which can in turn be used as an analytical tool in the next steps.

The following 7 hard facts provide the framework for the further analysis:

1. Participating countries and geographic coverage
2. Duration, size, form and settings of projects/programs
3. Target groups
4. Types of art
5. Involved professions
6. Resources

3.1. PARTICIPATING COUNTRIES and GEOGRAPHICAL COVERAGE

Projects and programs from 28 EU-Countries (and 31 non-EU-countries) took part and made available their program-/project-information, based upon our developed and transmitted questionnaire.

Most of the collected case studies (21) took place in one country, three of them on a local level at one place and 18 of them in several locations/regions. 19 of the projects were carried out in different countries (transnational) and within these: 9 of them within EU, 8 of them in EU and other European countries (plus Israel) and 2 are networks with partners in European and non-European countries.
3.2. **DURATION, SIZE, FORM AND SETTINGS of the projects / programs**

As described in the introduction of this chapter, there are case studies from individual little local projects up to bigger projects and programs (even networks) which are located in different places in one or more countries up to a global scale.

Accordingly, the number of participants ranged from under one hundred up to more than 50,000.

17 of the case studies are art projects in and outside of schools, in a cooperation of school with child- and youth centres, festivals, public music schools, theatres and auditoriums of the participating cities, hosting centres for refugees, partner institutions and their own learning spaces, museums, community centres and houses, libraries, etc. It is important to mention that in many cases the projects/activities take place in primary school plus in other locations in a mix of formal and non-formal settings.

16 of the analysed projects/programs are performed on multi-level, which means a mix of activities (art performance or -education and method- or curriculum-development, teacher- and/or artist-trainings, involvement of parents, etc.) with practical and theoretical parts. Three of the programs are teacher and artist trainings, three of them networks of practitioners or associations and last but not least there is one law.

As the following graphic illustrates: 19 of the projects lasted more than 3 years and 16 between one and three years. Besides there were 2 projects as short single action and 3 as multiple/repeated action.

36 of the case studies refer to primary school or children in this age group. Nine of the projects occur as long-term-offers in school-lessons/class, four as time-limited art projects in school-lessons. Six contain leisure offers in primary school, 11 leisure-offers outside of school and 18 concepts/tools – both for the age group of primary school pupils.

The emphasis on the age of the participants is mostly from 5-15, apart from that younger and older and some even cross-generational.

3.3. **TARGET GROUPS - Sorted in primary and secondary and more**

The target groups can be sorted in two levels: primary and secondary target groups.

The primary target groups include: migrant children and their families; first- or second-generation immigrant; children and families from cultural, political and religious minority backgrounds; refugees, asylum seekers and others like: displaced children, children at risk, young people with marginalized and underprivileged background, economically excluded from the society, in unsettled domestic situations and people with disabilities.

The secondary target groups cover: teachers, trainers and students; schools which are characterized by social and spatial vulnerability, migration flow presence of ethnic minorities and coexistence of groups in processes of ethnic identification; public and private educational authorities; representatives of cultural centers and civil society organizations working with minority groups; parents’ associations; representatives of...
local and national authorities, representative of EU institutions and public opinion makers; local and national press.

The following graphic represents the distribution and composition of the two target groups in the examined case studies:

Furthermore we can notice, that the focus in most case studies was on working with a mix of minorities and locals.

### 3.4. TYPES OF ART - A wide variety

The art forms in the collected case studies represent a wide variety – most notably: music, theatre, dance, literature/creative writing/storytelling and painting (visual and fine art, photo, graphic and graffiti).

A more precise determination of the various forms of art is the following:

**Theatre:** theatre in education, theatre on stilts, theatre for inclusion, puppet shows  
**Music:** ensemble orchestra, classic music, singing, band, choir, Folklore songs, African percussion and body percussion, songs, karaoke  
**Dance:** hip-hop, folklore  
**Painting:** fine art, graffiti, silk painting  
**Performing art/plastic art**  
**Circus** performing: acrobatic, clowning, manipulation, stilt-walking, juggling, unicycling, ball walking and tightrope, dance and movement  
**Handcraft:** woodwork, metal jewel, felting  
**Visual art:** video, graphics, photography, cinema  
**Art to speak:** rap, storytelling  
**Creative writing**  
**Literature:** Literature readings, picture books, fairy tales  
Games: board and parlour games  
Media and new media and digital tool: blog, podcast, movie, e-book audio  
**Drama pedagogy**  
**Sport games**  
**Street art**  
**Installations**  
**Movement**

### 3.5. INVOLVED PROFESSIONS - Artists, educators/teachers and much more

There are varied professions and staff involved in the projects: Artists, (artist-)facilitators, teachers, trainers, educators, social workers, psychologists, sociologists, University Professors, students, experts of activist theatre/voice training/drawing/acting/dancing/playing music, art practitioners (any art form), parents,
Authorities /policy makers, Pedagogues Art therapists, workshop and project leader, administrative staff, volunteers, cultural operators and mediators, experts, ‘early childhood practitioners’, health mediators, pedagogues; representatives of immigrants, associations, advocates of children’s rights; practitioners, evaluators; methodology experts; etc.

3.6. RESOURCES- Time, staff, equipment, tools, trainings, etc.

Concerning the required resources listed: Funding, staff, material/equipment, tools, rooms/spaces/ places, cultural associations, training/seminars for the teaching stuff, travelling (for participation into seminars and exchange of experiences), facilitators/coordination, teacher time, teacher planning time, ongoing professional development, dedication and commitment.

Concerning the financing of the projects, there are different pathways: Through European, national and regional Funds or Grants; through ministries; through departments of education or culture; through Foundations, through national and local Trusts; through municipalities’ collaborations, through commercial sponsors; through donations; through members; etc. There all kinds of funding’s, like: donations; European Social Fund and Ministry for Culture (85% + 15%); aid of the NGO Fund of the EEA Grants; through Foundations, through municipalities collaborations, through UNESCO Chair collaboration; co-financed (75%) through the Lifelong Learning program of the European Commission and the partners for 25%; co-funded through the European Commission, self-funded through a group of people, the authors of the methodology; through European funds (former Leonardo program and European Social Fund); through Regional Funds; supported by Central European Initiative, Ministry of Culture and Information; Art Council; Foundations and Trusts (several answers); one component of a larger TCAPS grant from the US Department of Education that aimed at developing a model approach for integrating art into regular classroom instruction; special grant from department education; Co-funded through the project partners; EU-Fond, locally raised funds (several answers), national and local Trust, national funds for special education, local fundraising also through collection of fees; collaboration with Orchestras, Social Fund Regional Funds PORFSE; through the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Government Communication Office and Ministry of Culture; Municipality and Book Agency; Human Capital Operational Program, the Ministry of Education, Youth and Science, etc.

Regarding an evaluation: Most of the projects have been externally evaluated (by professionals like Universities (different Departments) or others) or they are still in the process of evaluation.

4. THE MAIN TOPICS OF THE CASE STUDIES

A main innovation in education through art is the nature of a program that consists not in learning art but in learning through art as a methodology. Art becomes a tool in the discussion of equality and integration/inclusion of minorities by promoting individual and group competences, diversity-approaches and bringing about changes in organisations and educational systems.

We analysed the impacts of education through art in 40 case studies, selected by all META partners. We verified the statements based on our developed indicators, defined in collaboration with all partners. As a result, we identified the following aspects, essential for successful Art Education projects to the objective of the META project. Following them, the analysed case studies can be classified by the following six topics, considering their stated objectives:

1. The promotion of CULTURAL DIVERSITY and the counteraction of discrimination and exclusion
2. The support of INCLUSION/ INTEGRATION and accessibility/ equality for minorities
3. The strengthening of the PERSONALITY DEVELOPMENT and the key competences for lifelong learning
4. The use of ART AS A TOOL for holistic learning processes
5. The QUALIFICATION (preparation and training) of TEACHERS
6. The initiation / introduction of CHANGES in school life

4.1. The promotion of CULTURAL DIVERSITY and the counteraction of discrimination and exclusion

One important topic in almost all case studies is to understand and respect the challenges and chances of cultural diversity in our increasingly globalized world.
The valuing of difference is a core value, it starts from the staff (teachers and artists), which is in itself diverse and mirrors in the wide audience of children and youth involved. Teachers are role models. If art educators and schoolteachers receive training on the role of culture, cultural identities and cultural diversity, they are encouraged to promote the expression of the cultural identities of the participants they work with through their art educational activities. Therefore, the support of intercultural competence of teachers is mentioned and included in many of the case studies.

Diversity management in schools can be used as a support, monitoring, evaluation and self-assessment tool for practices of welcoming care and enhancement of all the diversity present in its interior. It can help to transform the regional school system, concretely and on a daily basis, in a "community of difference".

To include the cultural heritage of the participants in the joint action supports the preservation and visualization of the various traditions and an accessibility to and motivation of the participants. They can express their culture and identity and make the experience of esteem/high regard. The result is a mutual understanding, respect and tolerance for the various cultures, integration of different cultures.

### 4.2. The support of INCLUSION/ INTEGRATION and accessibility/ equality for minorities

Another important topic is to counteract discrimination and social exclusion. We have to tackle stereotypes about differences and start to reflect on our own prejudices to change the social image of minority groups and strengthen inclusiveness, accessibility and community involvement.

The task is to explore and open issues of involvement and inclusion of (national) minorities in social, political, economic and cultural life of countries and regions to achieve full participation in the civil society and to provide equal educational opportunities for disadvantaged children, in particular when coming from difficult social contexts, and for children with special needs. Education through art allows participation, whether or not the person speaks the language or not, has physical, psychological or mental impairments or learning difficulties.

For schools, this means to increase skills of teachers to work with children of minority origin and to promote a physical art curriculum in the classroom that can foster successful dynamics of valorization and inclusion of children with very different backgrounds, in an enhancing environment of family and larger community participation, to minimize barriers and maximize resources of young people to accomplish a more successful school career and especially to prevent early school leaving. Schools need to meet the child's social and emotional needs and those criteria are judged as key parameters for minority families who find difficult to interrelate with the school environment. The involvement of families and representatives of the minority and the inclusion of art forms defined and set up by the minority participants (for example: special forms of dancing, language and music of the participants, local tradition customs, artistic expression, oral history and folklore) as a way that it should come from the target group and their interest/knowledge, is crucial.

There were, for example, several case studies/projects which aimed to enhance Roma and non-Roma children's ability to learn through different art forms while promoting their access to education and therefore improving their chances in life. In a way that promotes the effective empowerment of Romani children as European citizens, helping them acquire the basic life-skills and competences. The projects intend to involve Romani children and keep them on formal and non-formal educational paths, and to raise the interest and participation of Romani children in learning activities (also to prevent early school leaving and to prevent behaviors such as drug abuse, early pregnancies, etc.). The case studies showed that through the activities their key competences through art increased, which is necessary for their personal development and to be successful in their future job situation. The projects also supported the raising of awareness among European and local decision-makers and the general public about the importance of art as a social and cultural integration tool that is well adaptable to Roma culture. The art activities included Romani and non-Romani people to interact within the wider community. Thus, it has been realized that the attention of general public as well as independent artists had been attracted to long-lasting and profound social exclusion issues related to Roma children in Europe. The awareness of the importance of promoting the minority's culture at all levels to enable mechanisms of respect and tolerance in society had been increased.

### 4.3. The Strengthening of the PERSONALITY DEVELOPMENT and KEY COMPETENCES of children

In all the case studies, a strengthening of the individuals could be observed, as a result of learning through art and using the cultural heritage of the participants to foster dialogue about diversity.

The focus of learning through art is particularly relevant in 3 of the 8 lifelong-learning key competences: learning to learn, social and civic competences and cultural awareness and expression. The main strength is that art has an impact on children regardless of their cultural background, without boundaries, since they
encourage expression, and individuality as well as teamwork. In addition, art helps to develop important key competences of life-long-learning (as described above) and thus promotes the development of personality. If children/youth get the opportunity to spread their wings and experiment in a safe environment - it encourages their self-confidence, growth, evolution, and ability to make friends. It strengthens social skills building on their personal experience.

Learning through art helps to improve young people’s identity, self-esteem, self-awareness and self-efficacy. Art is a source of developing motivation, engagement and autonomy. Art training and practice is implemented through group work. In this context, respect for others, capacities for team working and the development of inter-cultural communication skills are integral parts of the art educational process.

Art-making supports crosscutting competences, like strength, endurance, flexibility, responsibility, expression and communications of ideas, alternative and critical thinking, problem solving, taking initiative, exploratory behavior, self-confidence, self-reliance, address of needs, decision-making skills, teamwork/team-building, adapting within the group or sense of belonging to a group, collaborative learning, etc. Through art creation children can enhance their learning as well as understand and process their worldviews. Art Education can be used to develop children’s identities.

### 4.4. The use of ART AS A TOOL for holistic learning processes

The access via art increases the motivation to learn. Learning though art combines and supports many more competences than creativity and expression, competences (see the crosscutting competences mentioned above) which are important in a society. Art can be used for a wide range of purposes ranging from expression of children to bringing communities together.

The nature of learning through art consists not in learning art but in learning through art as a methodology. The aim is to promote participation in personal growth. It prioritizes the development of transversal objectives over the attainment of the specific objectives. The art and its forms of expression are creating experiences that generate a sense of membership, connecting and empowerment as well as learning and knowledge.

Non-formal learning offers the possibility to take up the lifeworld interests of participants, to pay attention to self-imposed learning objectives, to support self-initiated learning and to create the experience of self-efficacy through their own actions. The linking of formal learning processes / institutionally stamped learning with the experiences of the participants, their social environment, their perspective of the lifeworld practice means the linking of compulsory subjects with creative ways of learning that supports motivation for learning itself and the anchoring of them in standard education systems.

Art - used as a tool in schools - can support the acquisition of any (primary) school subject. An approach adaptable to any existing curriculum has the potential to offer teachers a real methodology to bring art into the teaching practice. You can reach better learning effects by linking cognitive, emotional, and social learning. The integration of a variety of art-forms creates new combined practices which approach the child on a holistic level, meaning socially, emotionally and physically, in form of an experience-based learning, new forms of art and their applications in social and educational settings, that have inspired art practitioners, teachers and social workers to describe and discuss practices in their own learning spaces. These are positive outcomes of deep levels of engagement and of quality of interaction.

### 4.5. The QUALIFICATION of TEACHERS

Several of the projects aimed to develop (primary) schoolteachers to deal with the changing world of the 21st century. Furthermore, they developed new learning opportunities for teachers and students, new skills that are essential. School is the place where children from different cultural as well as socio-economic backgrounds meet. However, teachers often face problems in their daily practice that arise due to a diverse or heterogeneous class composition and at the same time lack specific methods and concepts to address these issues in a professional way. This raises the question of how teachers could be supported to deal with it. Several approaches could be helpful:

- The providing of assistance for teachers to use art in ways that strengthen children’s thinking and learning processes in a holistic sense concerning body, mind, emotions and attitudes / key competences. The organization of workshops in innovation in teaching methodology (experiential learning, intercultural approach, socio-artistic methodologies, etc.). The idea is to encourage a holistic way of working with children where learning is a life experience-based process through the workshops or seminars.
• The establishment of **tandems and co-working-teams** of teachers and artists to support a mutual influence of the involved professions. The initiation of a process of joint reflection and discussing of the targeted topics of relevance by participating artists, educators and professionals in frequent training

• workshops. The establishment of a process of periodic feedback, discussion and planning meetings between the key participants. Introduce and manage a continued collective reflection about the difficulties of the partnerships between art methodology and curricular contents. The promotion of **tandem hours in regular classes** (art as a pedagogical tool) – cooperation of artist and teacher to teach mandatory themes but through art / in leading art subjects.

• The development of a teacher-training course that considers methodological aspects and specific pedagogical and didactic approaches in the **communication with the parents**. It empowers parental involvement in school education and parent-institution cooperation as well as joint responsibility for education. The involvement of parents, families, communities in planning, realizing, evaluating or disseminating project and group **activities**.

• The introduction of obligatory **diversity trainings for teachers**. The carrying-out of a diversity-training course that offers various modules on **self-reflection** to enable the involved professions to become aware of their own possible and unconscious prejudices. For example based on the **anti-bias approach**, that contains a special focus on anti-discriminatory civic education. Anti-bias*, unlike other approaches in the field of intercultural education, does not focus solely on the individual level of discrimination. It also takes into consideration the complex interrelation between the individual, institutional and ideological level, where discrimination is likely to occur. If teachers receive training on the role of culture, cultural identities and cultural diversity, they are encouraged to promote the expression of the cultural identities of the participants they work with through their art educational activities. The fostering of **cross-cultural competences** of the staff to support the adaptation of methods of art mediation into intercultural settings. A training of teachers and involved professions to work in multicultural environments in new tools fostering inclusion and development of competences for an understanding of cultural differences in early child-hood education. The increase of skills of teachers to work with children with minority ethnic origin. The equipment of practitioners with the necessary tools, attitudes and competences to manage and work with diversity through positive interactions between learners from diverse backgrounds and to support positive communication among children of different linguistic and cultural origins.

• The production and usage of a **handbook** or teacher’s manual that contains ideas on how to work with different age groups on the subjects of migration, a reader of school practices on cultural diversity. The development of teaching methods and modules as well as **learning materials**, which are based on the diversity approach. The development of teaching and learning material for pupils in which the portrayal of pupils with a migration background is not homogenized or limited to stereotypical images.

• Create **networks for teachers and artists** for exchange, networking and transfer of knowledge and best practice.

4.6. The initiation / introduction of CHANGES in school life

The case studies highlight the needs of improvement of schools’ capacity to address cultural diversity for the better **inclusion** of children and parents in our intercultural society. There are several findings of programs, methods and approaches, which strongly support this change.

Especially the **network of cooperation/collaboration** in regional educational landscapes of communities has directly and indirectly a positive influence of the school development. Furthermore the creation of **partnerships** and/or (regional) **networks of different stakeholders**: school and cultural institution/cultural municipal houses and further different organizations/groups like local community organizations, social (welfare) organizations, NGO’s, youth centres, art organizations, volunteers, etc. helps to improve the schools to be more inclusive and to change and to open themselves to the everyday social environment. The case studies state that through the Art Education projects the schools were more able to establish active partnerships with local partners. The schools were able to establish in many cases a **cross-sectoral cooperation of fields of art and education** in formal and non-formal settings.

The schools changed in the way that they were able to create a **good learning environment, which inspired confidence** and advanced **motivation**. The change enhanced the support of collaboration and teamwork within the school and improved the integration/inclusion and mutual understanding.

The regular presence of artists in the schools required to design and to coordinate a strategy and a pedagogical framework based on with the teaching staff. Mainstream artistic activities in the didactic in the classroom showed the value of the choice of using art to foster inclusion of children with special needs.
Specific case studies demonstrate the development of **a model approach for integrating art into regular classroom instruction.**

Many of the case studies shown also formulate interventions that have been implemented within the school to promote intercultural dialogue and inclusion and prevent racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance. To provide schools with specialized professionals and to provide training to the educators and teachers will support them in making the school to be more inclusive.

### 5. CONCLUSIONS

The case studies show a large variety of art fields and a wide range of approaches to Art Education.

The case study collection is not a complete list of art fields, but clearly **demonstrates the numerous advantages of art forms, which are used in formal and non-formal settings.**

It illustrates the acknowledgement of different art forms that are being used in different cultures and therefore the higher chance to meet the needs of specific target groups and their specific backgrounds. Based on the questionnaires it can be stated that many projects consider using innovative methods/aspects/technique within their Art Educational activities.

The **case studies show a wide range of approaches** to Art Education and in this context, we would like to point out and recommend them for further implementation.

The **analysis of the 40 case studies** (the results were presented in detail on the previous pages) **can be summarized in the following conclusions:**

- **Art Education projects enhance the development of individual capabilities**
  
  Based on the existing case studies and researched projects it can be stated that they all promote the creative potential of children, youngsters and have even in some cases an intergenerational effect. Artists are involved in most of the art education projects, thus the projects provide an environment where the students are actively involved in creative experiences and processes. Besides several competences and skills students have the ability to develop transversal skills such as creativity and innovative capacity.

- **Art Education projects improve the inclusion of Minorities**
  
  Due to some of the very innovative methods and with using very different art forms it was possible within the researched projects to include children and youngsters with a minority background.

  In some cases the projects targeted just “minority groups” or supported socially disadvantaged children and young people but, in other cases – particularly in schools – those children participate together with other children in the projects.

- **There are several good practices that improve the Teacher Training**
  
  There are several projects across the study that do promote teacher trainings, whether they aim to develop training courses, do assessments of the needs of teachers, provide trainings or disseminate good practices. These projects help to establish an environment of collaboration and shared goals which also contribute to the development of a common European perspective about minority groups and their education.

  The ability of teachers to meet the challenges of increasing social and cultural diversity in the classroom is crucial for the development of more equitable education systems and for progress towards providing equal opportunities for all. (Conclusions of the Council and of the Representatives of the Governments of the Member States, meeting within the Council of 15 November 2007, on improving the quality of teacher education).

- **Art Education projects promote and require Multidisciplinary Cooperation**
  
  The case studies all show a wide range of cooperation, and in most cases there are many different professions involved in Art Education projects and there were in some projects medium and large networks developed. Furthermore, Art Education projects enhance the level of cooperation between authorities, NGO’s, schools, the private sector and grassroots organizations to increase participation of minorities (Roma etc.) to public life. They also help to create a European community space as a repository to exchange ideas and productions.
The quality of Art Education projects depends on how the projects (or the professions involved) combine formal and non-formal settings – an appropriate and target-groups-oriented connection of formal and non-formal settings enhances the quality of projects.

In the researched cases studies, non-formal education plays a crucial but also ambivalent role. It can be stated that in most cases the non-formal education didactics and programs are used inside as well as outside formal institutions to spot young people in precarious life circumstances and offer them opportunities to be creative, to improve their skills, to gain qualifications and to give them the perspective to learn through art.

The study shows a wide range of cross-sectoral cooperation of fields of art and education / (Regional) Networks of different partners, school and cultural institution/cultural municipal houses and further different organizations/groups like local community organizations, social (welfare) organizations, NGO’s, youth centers, art organizations, volunteers, etc.

High quality projects in the fields Art Education enhance Social Inclusion and Art Education projects support the development of the eight key competences

Key competences are needed for personal fulfilment and development, active citizenship, social inclusion and employment. The art education projects provide a rich and meaningful context for the development of the key competencies, which can be seen in many of the case studies. Furthermore, several case studies report specific activities which promoting ICT within Art Education. In most of the case studies we find integrated concepts which enhance social inclusion.

There exists a high potential of Funding Resources for Art Education – there exists a minimum of regularly funding in Art Education, it often needs great efforts to receive local/national/EU funding’s for Art Education projects

Within the study a great variety of funding sources for Art Education projects could be found. Through the questionnaires are some of the main sources were shown. Those funding sources have been successfully used by the actors of the researched projects. Even though several programs were not especially designed for Art Education programs, they still can be helpful financial resources based on creative project development, for projects designed for specific target groups (minorities etc.) and by building up strategic collaborations with partners.

The certain number of projects which were already finished by the time of the case study justifies the conclusion that the finished funding forced to stop the projects. It is currently not possible to consider the data by the limitations of the case study. The funding formulas differ from country to country.

Last but not least we would like to refer to quote: “There are likely to be other factors that influence a successful outcome that are less easily identified and articulated. As someone commenting on a draft of the review said, factors such as creative passion, dynamic interrelationships, tough love, imaginative and unplanned experimentation and innovative problem-solving, may not appear on good practice lists but they are relevant nevertheless.” (2004, Art Council England, the art of inclusion)

6. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations IN GENERAL TERMS

Thus it is recommended to:

- A wide variety of art forms used in cultural / Art Education will enhance the appreciation of their respective cultural histories. It opens the bandwidth of forms of expression, the diversity of cultural content and artistic expressions through appropriate measures, which facilitates the development of personalities of children and youngsters.
- Actors on the political level, civil-society actors and any other involved stakeholders should encourage multidisciplinary cooperation within the area of Art Education.
- Teaching methods and teacher trainings are essential for the improvement of the quality of Art Education. Therefore it is important to provide trainings on teaching methods of Art Education and the possibilities for exchanges of good practices on a regular basis. Furthermore, it would enhance the
quality and effectiveness to provide trainings for artists and teachers, both professional groups could provide each other with their special experiences and backgrounds. (tandem)

- To offer professional, development and programming tools to the actors of art education programs that will prepare them and their communities to access and better qualify for funding opportunities.

- To recognize and make visible schools who engage in collaborative projects between schools and between schools and other institutions in the medium and long term, in order to achieve their Plans of Difference Manage.

- To enhance the replicability of the experience, through the work of facilitators who help and accompany the teachers' activities.

- To disseminate results to other schools as experiences in a school, creating networks between schools that perform tasks in parallel and collaboration.

- To encourage initiatives of research / action and therefore pursue a goal of training of the school staff and lead to the creation of effective organizational and methodological changes in the school environment aimed at making the school more inclusive of cultural, psychophysical and gender diversities.

- To create a database to document the initiatives of the schools so that they are monitorable, verifiable, measurable in their process and their outcomes, including by external observers.

- To implement evaluation/program monitoring (Process evaluations and outcome evaluation) within the projects and to make them available to other projects (Finding out “what does not work” is as important as finding out “what does work.”)

- To give children/young people space for Art Education activities and to give them possibilities for participation.

- To increase the number of schools and children with access to art-integration through artists in schools.

Recommendations FOR EDUCATORS, ARTISTS AND TRAINERS AND OTHER PROFESSIONS INVOLVED IN ART EDUCATION

Thus it is recommended to:

- Encourage and active and art-rich learning environment in formal and non-formal institutions/organizations etc.

- Establish a school-wide commitment to art learning.

- Identify possibilities of Art Education in budgets of schools and non-formal organizations (to identify resource gaps).

- Encourage cooperation and professional exchange regarding Art Education and develop partnerships with art or cultural organizations and vice versa

- To encourage teachers to take part in “Diversity Trainings” and to create opportunities for trainings.

- To invite artists to trainings together with teachers/educators (tandem/tridem trainings).

- To establish art as an integral part of what “defines” the school; to honor students’ artistic and creative talents; to create opportunities to show their talents and to create space for creative activities.

- To work closely together with parents, to encourage parents and to engage them and to communicate closely with them (art programs in the school also provide opportunities to engage parents in their students’ work in ways that traditional academics might not).

- To include the important topic of “transitions in the development of the child” into Art Educations programs and activities (school entrance, change from 6th grade to 7th grade etc.).

Recommendations FOR SCHOOLS AND EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS

Promote during initial teacher education, early career support and through continuous professional development the acquisition of competences which will enable teachers to:

- Teach transversal competences such as those outlined in the Recommendation on key competences.

- Create a safe and attractive school environment which is based on mutual respect and cooperation.
• Teach effectively in heterogeneous classes of pupils from diverse social and cultural backgrounds and with a wide range of abilities and needs, including special education needs.
• Work in close collaboration with colleagues, parents and the wider community.
• Participate in the development of the school or training center in which they are employed, develop new knowledge and be innovative through engagement in reflective practice and research.
• Make use of ICT in their various tasks, as well as in their own continuing professional development.
• Become autonomous learners in their own career-long professional development.2
• Develop inclusive school concepts.
• Develop the awareness of linguistic and cultural diversity among the students and their families.
• Cooperate closely with the community and to encourage the participation of the community.
• Promote a systemic view in favor of a multi-dimensional perspective which includes the social environment.
• To encourage the participation of migrant organizations and artists with migrant backgrounds in Art Education projects in formal and non-formal settings.

Recommendations FOR CULTURAL INSTITUTIONS
The analysis of the cases studies, professional discussions about art education on the local level and the desk research showed that:
• It is very important to increase the co-operation between schools, youth organizations and cultural institutions.
• The cultural institutions should provide their space for art education and open themselves up to schools and for co-operations. (Museums, theatres, concert halls etc.)

Recommendations FOR STAKEHOLDERS (Minority Groups Organizations) and NGOs
Thus it is recommended to:
• To support developing the awareness of linguistic and cultural diversity among the students and their families.
• To collect data on good practices and to share information and evidence with other stakeholders, including governments, communities, the media, other NGO’s and the private sector.
• Develop and implement arts projects in theatres and cultural institutions.
• Establish multi-professionals Art Study Groups and to encourage the participation of migrant organizations and artists with migrant backgrounds.

Recommendations FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT MINISTRIES and POLICY MAKERS
The study shows a wide range of cross-sectoral cooperation of fields of art and education / (Regional) Networks of different partners, school and cultural institution/cultural municipal houses and further different organizations/groups like local community organizations, social (welfare) organizations, NGO’s, youth centers, art organizations, volunteers, etc.
Thus it is recommended to
• Encourage active and sustainable partnerships between educational contexts (formal and non-formal) and the wider community.
• Support a collaborative school-community projects that are based on the principles of inclusive cooperation and integration.
• Support the development of Art Education projects within the local context.

2 Conclusions of the Council and of the Representatives of the Governments of the Member States, meeting within the Council of 15 November 2007, on improving the quality of teacher education)
Recommendations for NATIONAL GOVERNMENT MINISTRIES and POLICY MAKERS

- Recognize the role of Art Education in preparing audiences and different sectors of the public to appreciate artistic manifestations.
- At the governmental level, supporting Art Education and training as a principle means for building individual creative capacity, which is essential for advancement towards innovative social development.
- Fostering co-operation between the Ministries of several areas as Ministry of Education, Youth, Family, Culture, Urban Planning and so on to promote the inter-ministerial co-ordination in building up the public Art Educational system for both professional training of the gifted children and youth and art learning for all children and to improve the use of the funds and funding of Art Education in a more sustainable way.

Recommendations regarding the Data collection / Data management and transparency

Currently there is no EU requirement for equality data collection. Equality data collection must start to take place in Europe to ensure that we know more clearly where discrimination occurs and how to develop the policies required shifting.³

Recommendations FOR UNIVERSITIES

There is a lack of impact research which needs to be supported and developed as well as to support Research capacity building activities.

REFERENCES / BIBLIOGRAPHY

AEMS (2013): survey on human resources in arts and cultural education. survey for institutions.
Agaidyan, Ovagem: BODI - Cultural diversity, body, gender, health in early childhood education. IO1 – Reader of School Practices on Culture, Body, Gender, Health
Bundesvereinigung (BKJ): Cultural Education Is Coproduction. Developing extra-curricular and school cultural education effectively.
Commission/EACEA/Eurydice, European; 2015: The Structure of the European Education Systems 2015/16: Schematic Diagrams,

European Commission; Migration and Home Affairs (2016): A European Agenda on Migration.

Eurydice: Developing Key Competences at School in Europe (2012): Challenges and Opportunities for Policy.


Fondazione Nazionale Carlo Collodi, Collodi - PT- Italy: ARTinED a new approach to education using the Arts 2013.


KEA - European Affairs (2015): Feasibility study on data collection and analysis in the cultural and creative sectors in the EU.


UNESCO: Seoul Agenda: Goals for the Development of Arts Education.


Witte, R.: Creative Alliances for Europe. A report prepared by BKJ (Germany) and CCE (England).

WORKING GROUP OF EU MEMBER STATES EXPERTS (2012): POLICY HANDBOOK ON How to strategically use the EU support programmes, including Structural Funds, to foster the potential of culture for local, regional and national development and the spill-over effects on the wider economy? WORK PLAN FOR CULTURE 2011-2014.

Links to online resources

http://www.oecd.org/education/innovation-education/migrateducation-backgroundreports.htm
https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/topics/sustainabledevelopmentgoals
http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/web/sdi/indicators/social-inclusion